

When calling or telephoning please ask for

Mr G Durham

Direct line or ext

742222

My ref

GD/SH – R82/48

19 November 2010

To the Chair and Members

of the

CONSERVATION ADVISORY  
WORKING PARTY

Dear Sir/Madam

A meeting of the **CONSERVATION ADVISORY WORKING PARTY** will be held in **COMMITTEE ROOM 1, CIVIC OFFICES, MERRIAL STREET, NEWCASTLE** on **TUESDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2010** at **7pm**.

#### **AGENDA**

1. To receive Declarations of Interest from Members on items included in this agenda.
2. Minutes of meeting held on 9 November 2010 (copy attached for non-Council Members information).
3. To consider the attached reports at Appendix A and B (blue and salmon paper).
4. To consider any applications for financial assistance from the Conservation and Heritage Fund which may have been brought to this meeting by the Officer.
5. To consider any business which is urgent within the meaning of Section 100B(4) of the Local Government Act 1972.

Yours faithfully

**P W CLISBY**

Head of Central Services

**Members: Councillors Miss Cooper, Heesom, Mrs Naylor, Wemyss and Mrs Williams.**

**Outside Representatives: Messrs Chatterton, Ferrington, Heeks, Manning, Miss Barter, Tribbeck and Worgan**

**The appropriate Parish Council representative(s)**

**DECISIONS OF THE BOROUGH COUNCIL ON APPLICATIONS WHICH  
HAVE PREVIOUSLY BEEN CONSIDERED BY THE WORKING PARTY**

For reports on all committee decisions, please follow the minutes and agendas search on the Council's website or refer to your copy of the Planning agenda for the permitted date. Reports for delegated items are attached to the agenda (pink paper).

Reference	Location and Applicant	Development	Working Party Comments	Planning Decision
<b>10/159/LBC</b>	The Lodge, Whitmore Hall, Whitmore Road, Whitmore Mr G Cavenagh-Mainwaring	Single storey side extension	The Conservation Advisory Working Party objected to the false gable as the best solution although they welcomed the attempt to tidy up the building. The Working Party suggested a green roof would be a more appropriate and honest way of dealing with this problem. The Architecture Centre can provide specific advice on designs and costings.	Permitted under delegated powers 26 October, 2010
<b>10/416/FUL &amp; 10/417/LBC</b>	Old Hall, Poolside, Madeley Mr G White	Conversion and extension of outbuilding into living accommodation	The Working Party generally felt that this design was better than the previous proposal but were still disappointed with the approach. Some attempt had been made to match the existing windows on the side elevation but the gable elevation is unacceptable and the window/door design needs revising to be more sympathetic to the existing building with a quality traditional approach.	Permitted by Planning Committee 26 October, 2010
<b>10/497/FUL &amp; 10/498/LBC</b>	Willoughbridge Lodge Cottage, Willoughbridge Lane, Willoughbridge Mr R McDowell	Two storey side extensions and removal of existing garage and conservatory	The proposal would destroy the special character of the Listed Building and is therefore contrary to Policy B6. The potential for below ground archaeology was raised by the Working Party.	Applications withdrawn

**CONSERVATION ADVISORY WORKING PARTY**

<b>Reference</b>	<b>Location and Applicant</b>	<b>Development</b>	<b>Remarks</b>	<b>Ward Councillors</b>
<b>10/485/ADV</b>	49 High Street, Newcastle Wrights Pies Ltd	Installation of RAL coated 30mm folded aluminium fascia panel illuminated by a cornice concealed trough fluorescent light	Adjacent to a listed building within the Newcastle Town Centre Conservation Area	Councillor D Clarke Councillor Mrs E Shenton
<b>10/594/FUL</b>	New Harecastle Farm, Newcastle Road, Talke Mr A Huxley	Erection of an agricultural building to house cattle	Affects the setting of a Listed Building	Councillor D Daniels Councillor R Slater
<b>10/611/COU</b>	159 High Street, Wolstanton Mr M Naeem	Change of used of ground floor from commercial to residential use	Within the Wolstanton Conservation Area	Councillor Mrs Y Burke Councillor M Olszewski Councillor D Woolley
<b>10/613/FUL</b>	The Old Vicarage, Vicarage Lane, Madeley Mr & Mrs Goodwin	New boiler house for bio mass plant equipment and pellet storage	Within the Madeley Conservation Area	Councillor Mrs H Morris Councillor B Welsh
<b>10/616/LBC</b>	The Chapel, Keele University. University of Keele	Internal alterations to University Chapel to form toilet accommodation	The Chapel is a Grade II Listed Building	Councillor Mrs W Naylor Councillor R Studd
<b>10/617/FUL</b>	50-54 Church Street, Audley Mr F Boon	Change of use to restaurant with managers accommodation over and alterations to shop front, rear fire escape and ground floor rear extension.	Within the Audley Conservation Area	Councillor Mrs A Beech Councillor Mrs D Cornes Councillor I Wilkes
<b>10/619/FUL</b>	Keele University, Whitmore Road, Keele University of Keele	Proposed rebuilding of the boathouse sited on Lake number one.	Within the Keele Hall Conservation Area	Councillor Mrs W Naylor Councillor R Studd
<b>10/621/FUL</b>	Butterton Nurseries, Park Road, Butterton Mr & Mrs J N Leath	Two detached bungalows with attached office accommodation	Within the Butterton Conservation Area	Councillor A Howells Councillor Mrs F Myatt Councillor B Tomkins
<b>10/628/FUL</b>	Marsh Trees House, Marsh Parade, Newcastle Richard Baker Harrison Ltd	Proposed temporary siting of a portakabin to the rear lower level car park	Within the Stubbs Walk Conservation Area	Councillor D Clarke Councillor Mrs E Shenton
<b>10/629/FUL</b>	49 High Street, Newcastle Wrights Pies Ltd	Installation of new timber shop front	Adjacent to a listed building within the Newcastle Town Centre Conservation Area	Councillor D Clarke Councillor Mrs E Shenton

## **OFFICER REPORT ON DELEGATED ITEMS**

**Applicant** Mr. Cavenagh-Mainwaring

**Application No** 10/00159/LBC

**Location** Whitmore Lodge, Whitmore

**Description** - Single storey extension

### **Policies and proposals in the Development Plan relevant to this decision:**

Staffordshire and Stoke-on Trent-Structure Plan 1996 - 2011

Policy NC18: Listed Buildings

Newcastle-under-Lyme and Stoke-on-Trent Core Spatial Strategy 2006 – 2026 adopted 2009

Policy CSP1: Design Quality

Policy CSP2: Historic Environment

Newcastle-Under-Lyme Local Plan 2011

Policy B5: Control of Development Affecting The Setting of a Listed Building

Policy B6: Extension or Alteration of Listed Buildings

### **Other Material Considerations**

Relevant National Policy Guidance:

PPS1: Delivering Sustainable Development

PPS5: Planning for the Historic Environment (March 2010)

Companion Guide to PPS1 “The Planning System: General Principles”

### **Planning History**

None relevant to the determination of this application.

### **Views of Consultees**

**CAWP - Conservation Advisory Working Party** object to the false gable as the best solution, although they welcomed the attempt to tidy up the building. The Working Party suggested a green roof would be a more appropriate and honest way of dealing with this problem. The architecture centre can provide specific advice in designs and costings.

**Whitmore Parish Council** raise no objection to this application as the planned work will improve the appearance considerably.

### **Representations**

None received.

### **Applicants/agents submission**

The application has been supported by a Design and Access Statement which has been amended following amended plans also being submitted. The DAS predominantly provides a design justification for the proposed development and the use of a ‘green (grass) roof’.

Technical data of the proposed 'green roof' or 'Sky Garden' material to be incorporated on the flat roof extension has been provided also.

### **Key Issues**

This application is for listed building consent for an extension attached to the side elevation of the building. The development has been partially constructed and is essentially covering a small side alley between the main building and the retaining wall of the garden. The electrics and boiler are located in this space and so the extension would provide an essential addition.

The property is a Grade II listed building and in particular, policies B5 & B6 are of importance in this instance. These seek to resist proposals that adversely affect the setting and character of its architectural or historic features.

The partially constructed extension represents an inappropriate addition and the extension that is proposed would improve the character and appearance of the building. Officers raised concerns about the false lean-to towards the front of the proposed extension with the remainder being a flat roof. These concerns were echoed by CAWP and this has led to amended plans being submitted with the roof design/ material being addressed. A lean-to that would extend the length of the extension would have been the preferred design solution that would have respected the character and quality of the listed building. However, windows located at first floor level mean that this was not possible and so the false lean-to was proposed.

The amended design is now for a wholly flat roof but with a 'green roof' which is a pre grown vegetation covering. This is considered a more preferable design solution because the extension would infill a gap between the building and a retaining wall which supports a grassed embankment. Therefore the 'green roof' design would help the extension to blend into this embankment and would help to preserve the character of the listed building, this being considered acceptable.

In essence the extension is of a modest size and whilst flat roof extensions are generally not supported on listed buildings, it is considered that the introduction of a 'green roof' would improve the acceptability of the proposal in terms of its impact on the character of the listed building, as opposed to a dull flat or lead roof covering.

Due to the unacceptable appearance of the partially constructed extension and the amount of time this has remained in this manner, it is considered that a condition is necessary to require the works to be completed within 6 months of the date of this decision.

In summary it is not considered that the proposed extension would have any detrimental impact on the character or appearance of the Listed Building, subject to conditions, in particular that the roof material is a 'green roof' and the works are carried out within 6 months.

### **Reason for the grant of listed building consent:**

It is considered that the proposal does not have any detrimental impact on the character or appearance of this Grade II Listed Building, and accordingly the proposal complies with policies in the development plan indicated in the decision notice and national guidance on works to Listed buildings.

### **Recommendation**

#### **Grant consent subject to the following conditions;**

1. The development hereby approved shall be carried out and completed in strict accordance with the approved plans detailed in condition 2 below within 6 months of the date of this permission unless otherwise agreed in writing with the LPA.

Reason: To protect and safeguard the historic fabric and appearance of the listed building in accordance with the requirements of Policy NC18 of the Staffordshire and Stoke-on-Trent Structure

Plan 1996-2011, Policy B6 of the Newcastle-under-Lyme Local Plan 2011 and the guidance given in PPS5.

2. The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans;

- Drawing title – ‘side elevation as proposed east’ (scale 1:50), date stamped received by the Local Planning Authority on the 14 October 2010
- Drawing title – ‘front elevation as proposed south’ (scale 1:50), date stamped received by the Local Planning Authority on the 14 October 2010
- Drawing title – ‘proposed plan’ (scale 1:100), date stamped received by the Local Planning Authority on the 14<sup>th</sup> October 2010.
- Block Plan (scale 1:500), date stamped received by the Local Planning Authority on the 10 September 2010.
- Location Plan (scale 1:2500), date stamped received by the Local Planning Authority on the 10 September 2010.
- Sky-Garden Sedum Blanket Technical Data Sheet date stamped received by the Local Planning Authority on the 14<sup>th</sup> October 2010.
- Sky-Garden Systems Type Sheet date stamped received by the Local Planning Authority on the 14<sup>th</sup> October 2010.
- Sky-Garden Technical Details date stamped received by the Local Planning Authority on the 14<sup>th</sup> October 2010.

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and in the interests of proper planning.

3. The materials to be used shall be in strict accordance with those specified on the amended plans and supporting information detailed in condition no. 2 above unless different materials are first agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority. Development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To protect and safeguard the historic fabric and appearance of the listed building in accordance with the requirements of Policy NC18 of the Staffordshire and Stoke-on-Trent Structure Plan 1996-2011, Policy B6 of the Newcastle-under-Lyme Local Plan 2011 and the guidance given in PPS5.

Performance Checks	Date		Date
Consultee/ Publicity Period	<b>05.10.2010</b>	Decision Sent Out	
Case Officer Recommendation	<b>26.10.2010</b>	8 Week Determination	<b>05.11.2010</b>
Management check	<b>26/10/10</b> <b>NV</b>	<b>GM</b>	